

EVANGELISM TRAINING: Responding to Catholicism P.4

5 Things to Say to a Catholic — Adapted from Ron Rhodes

5. _____

Catholic Position —

- Purgatory is a place of temporary _____ where a believer is _____ after death before entering heaven
 - **CCC 1030** — All who die in God’s grace and friendship, but still imperfectly purified, are indeed assured of their eternal salvation; but after death they undergo purification, so as to achieve the holiness necessary to enter the joy of heaven.
 - **CCC 1031** — The Church gives the name *Purgatory* to this final purification of the elect, which is entirely different from the punishment of the damned. The Church formulated her doctrine of faith on Purgatory especially at the Councils of Florence and Trent. The tradition of the Church, by reference to certain texts of Scripture, speaks of a cleansing fire
 - **Council of Trent (Sources of Catholic Dogma) no. 840, p.261** — If anyone shall say that after the reception of the grace of justification, to every penitent sinner the guilt is so remitted and the penalty of eternal punishment so blotted out that no penalty of temporal punishment remains to be discharged either in this world or in the world to come in purgatory before the entrance to the kingdom of heaven can be opened: let him be anathema.
- Purgatory removes _____ from venial sins
 - **CCC 1472** — To understand this doctrine and practice of the Church, it is necessary to understand that sin has a *double consequence*. Grave sin deprives us of communion with God and therefore makes us incapable of eternal life, the privation of which is called the “eternal punishment” of sin. On the other hand every sin, even venial, entails an unhealthy attachment to creatures, which must be purified either here on earth, or after death in the state called Purgatory. This purification frees one from what is called the “temporal punishment” of sin. These two punishments must not be conceived of as a kind of vengeance inflicted by God from without, but as following from the very nature of sin. A conversion which proceeds from a fervent charity can attain the complete purification of the sinner in such a way that no punishment would remain.
- Purgatory can be shortened for oneself and the deceased through _____, _____, and _____
 - **CCC 1471** — What is an indulgence? “An indulgence is a remission before God of the temporal punishment due to sins whose guilt has already been forgiven, which the faithful Christian who is duly disposed gains under certain prescribed conditions through the action of the Church which, as the minister of redemption, dispenses and applies with authority the treasury of the satisfactions of Christ and the saints.”
 - **CCC 1498** — Through indulgences the faithful can obtain the remission of temporal punishment resulting from sin for themselves and also for the souls in Purgatory.

Their Defense —

- A. 1 Corinthians 3:11-15 — ¹¹ For no one can lay a foundation other than that which is laid, which is Jesus Christ. ¹² Now if anyone builds on the foundation with gold, silver, precious stones, wood, hay, straw— ¹³ each one's work will become manifest, for the Day will disclose it, because it will be revealed by fire, and the fire will test what sort of work each one has done. ¹⁴ If the work that anyone has built on the foundation survives, he will receive a reward. ¹⁵ **If anyone's work is burned up, he will suffer loss, though he himself will be saved, but only as through fire.**

- **Response:** Paul speaks about a day of judgment where a _____ to determine if they are worthy of a reward (not a person being purged of sin in purgatory)
 - The works are burned—not the person
 - This is about rewards or lack of rewards for one's faithfulness
 - **2 Corinthians 5:10** — ¹⁰ For we must all appear before the judgment seat of Christ, so that each one may receive what is due for what he has done in the body, whether good or evil.

- B. Matthew 12:32 — ³² And whoever speaks a word against the Son of Man will be forgiven, but whoever speaks against the Holy Spirit will not be forgiven, either in this age **or in the age to come.**

- **Response:** The Jewish leaders had completely hardened themselves to God by crediting to Satan things done by Jesus
 - "In the age to come" is an idiomatic way of saying the _____ (not that some sins will be forgiven through purgatory as argued by Catholics)

- C. Matthew 5:26 — ²⁶ Truly, I say to you, you will never get out **until you have paid the last penny.**

- **Response:** Jesus is referring to a _____ prison during earthly life not a _____ prison in the afterlife
 - **Matthew 5:25** — ²⁵ Come to terms quickly with your accuser while you are going with him to court, lest your accuser hand you over to the judge, and the judge to the guard, and you be put in prison.
 - This is a teaching on reconciliation (not a reference to purgatory)

- D. Galatians 6:2 — ² **Bear one another's burdens**, and so fulfill the law of Christ.

- **Response:** This verse is not about bearing the punishment for _____ (the argument made for indulgences)
 - Each person is responsible for their own sin
 - **Galatians 6:7** — ⁷ Do not be deceived: God is not mocked, for whatever one sows, that will he also reap.
 - This verse refers to believers helping each other when facing life's problems

Christian Position —

- There are Only Two Destinies After Death — _____ + _____
 - **Matthew 25:31-33** — ³¹“When the Son of Man comes in his glory, and all the angels with him, then he will sit on his glorious throne. ³²Before him will be gathered all the nations, and he will separate people one from another as a shepherd separates the sheep from the goats.
 - **Matthew 25:46** — ⁴⁶And these will go away into eternal punishment, but the righteous into eternal life.”
 - **Luke 16:26** — ²⁶And besides all this, between us and you a great chasm has been fixed, in order that those who would pass from here to you may not be able, and none may cross from there to us.
 - **Hebrews 9:27** — ²⁷And just as it is appointed for man to die once, and after that comes judgment,
 - **2 Thessalonians 1:8-9** — ⁸in flaming fire, inflicting vengeance on those who do not know God and on those who do not obey the gospel of our Lord Jesus. ⁹They will suffer the punishment of eternal destruction, away from the presence of the Lord and from the glory of his might
 - **Philippians 1:23** — ²³I am hard pressed between the two. My desire is to depart and be with Christ, for that is far better.
 - **2 Corinthians 5:8** — ⁸Yes, we are of good courage, and we would rather be away from the body and at home with the Lord
- We are Cleansed of Sin by the _____, Not the _____
 - **Hebrews 10:14** — ¹⁴For by a single offering he has perfected for all time those who are being sanctified.
 - **Hebrews 9:14** — ¹⁴how much more will the blood of Christ, who through the eternal Spirit offered himself without blemish to God, purify our conscience from dead works to serve the living God.
 - **John 19:30** — ³⁰When Jesus had received the sour wine, he said, “It is finished,” and he bowed his head and gave up his spirit.
 - **Romans 8:1** — There is therefore now no condemnation for those who are in Christ Jesus.
 - **2 Corinthians 5:21** — ²¹For our sake he made him to be sin who knew no sin, so that in him we might become the righteousness of God.
 - **Philippians 3:8-9** — ⁸Indeed, I count everything as loss because of the surpassing worth of knowing Christ Jesus my Lord. For his sake I have suffered the loss of all things and count them as rubbish, in order that I may gain Christ ⁹and be found in him, not having a righteousness of my own that comes from the law, but that which comes through faith in Christ, the righteousness from God that depends on faith—
 - **Jude 24** — ²⁴Now to him who is able to keep you from stumbling and to present you blameless before the presence of his glory with great joy,
 - **1 John 1:7** — ⁷But if we walk in the light, as he is in the light, we have fellowship with one another, and the blood of Jesus his Son cleanses us from all sin.

Addendum on Mary:

Catholic Position —

- Mary was born without _____ (Immaculate Conception of Mary) and _____ committed any sin
 - **IMMACULATE CONCEPTION:** The dogma proclaimed in Christian Tradition and defined in 1854, that from the first moment of her conception, Mary—by the singular grace of God and by virtue of the merits of Jesus Christ—was preserved immune from original sin (491).
 - **CCC 411** — Mary benefited first of all and uniquely from Christ’s victory over sin: she was preserved from all stain of original sin and by a special grace of God committed no sin of any kind during her whole earthly life.
 - **CCC 491** — Through the centuries the Church has become ever more aware that Mary, “full of grace” through God, was redeemed from the moment of her conception. That is what the dogma of the Immaculate Conception confesses, as Pope Pius IX proclaimed in 1854: (411) The most Blessed Virgin Mary was, from the first moment of her conception, by a singular grace and privilege of almighty God and by virtue of the merits of Jesus Christ, Savior of the human race, preserved immune from all stain of original sin.
 - **CCC 493** — The Fathers of the Eastern tradition call the Mother of God “the All-Holy” (*Panagia*) and celebrate her as “free from any stain of sin, as though fashioned by the Holy Spirit and formed as a new creature.” By the grace of God Mary remained free of every personal sin her whole life long.
- Mary was a _____ (she never had sexual relations with Joseph)
 - **CCC 499** — The deepening of faith in the virginal motherhood led the Church to confess Mary’s real and perpetual virginity even in the act of giving birth to the Son of God made man. In fact, Christ’s birth “did not diminish his mother’s virginal integrity but sanctified it.”¹⁵⁵ And so the liturgy of the Church celebrates Mary as *Aeiparthenos*, the “Ever-virgin.”
 - **CCC 500** — Against this doctrine the objection is sometimes raised that the Bible mentions brothers and sisters of Jesus. The Church has always understood these passages as not referring to other children of the Virgin Mary. In fact James and Joseph, “brothers of Jesus,” are the sons of another Mary, a disciple of Christ, whom St. Matthew significantly calls “the other Mary.”¹⁵⁸ They are close relations of Jesus, according to an Old Testament expression.
- Mary was preserved from _____, taken directly into _____, and exalted as _____ (Assumption of Mary)
 - **CCC 966** — “Finally the Immaculate Virgin, preserved free from all stain of original sin, when the course of her earthly life was finished, was taken up body and soul into heavenly glory, and exalted by the Lord as Queen over all things, so that she might be the more fully conformed to her Son, the Lord of lords and conqueror of sin and death.” The Assumption of the Blessed Virgin is a singular participation in her Son’s Resurrection and an anticipation of the resurrection of other Christians: (491) In giving birth you kept your virginity; in your Dormition you did not leave the world, O Mother of

God, but were joined to the source of Life. You conceived the living God and, by your prayers, will deliver our souls from death.

- Mary is the _____ in the work of salvation (co-redeemer, co-mediator, advocate)
 - **CCC 964** — Mary's role in the Church is inseparable from her union with Christ and flows directly from it. "This union of the mother with the Son in the work of salvation is made manifest from the time of Christ's virginal conception up to his death"; it is made manifest above all at the hour of his Passion: (534; 618) Thus the Blessed Virgin advanced in her pilgrimage of faith, and faithfully persevered in her union with her Son unto the cross. There she stood, in keeping with the divine plan, enduring with her only begotten Son the intensity of his suffering, joining herself with his sacrifice in her mother's heart, and lovingly consenting to the immolation of this victim, born of her: to be given, by the same Christ Jesus dying on the cross, as a mother to his disciple, with these words: "Woman, behold your son."
 - **CCC 968** — Her role in relation to the Church and to all humanity goes still further. "In a wholly singular way she cooperated by her obedience, faith, hope, and burning charity in the Savior's work of restoring supernatural life to souls. For this reason she is a mother to us in the order of grace." (494)
 - **CCC 969** — "This motherhood of Mary in the order of grace continues uninterrupted from the consent which she loyally gave at the Annunciation and which she sustained without wavering beneath the cross, until the eternal fulfilment of all the elect. Taken up to heaven she did not lay aside this saving office but by her manifold intercession continues to bring us the gifts of eternal salvation.... Therefore the Blessed Virgin is invoked in the Church under the titles of Advocate, Helper, Benefactress, and Mediatrix." (149, 501; 1370)
 - **CCC 970** — "Mary's function as mother of men in no way obscures or diminishes this unique mediation of Christ, but rather shows its power. But the Blessed Virgin's salutary influence on men ... flows forth from the superabundance of the merits of Christ, rests on his mediation, depends entirely on it, and draws all its power from it." "No creature could ever be counted along with the Incarnate Word and Redeemer; but just as the priesthood of Christ is shared in various ways both by his ministers and the faithful, and as the one goodness of God is radiated in different ways among his creatures, so also the unique mediation of the Redeemer does not exclude but rather gives rise to a manifold cooperation which is but a sharing in this one source."⁵¹⁴ (2008; 1545; 308)
- The _____ (hyperdulia) is to be given to Mary as the Mother of God
 - **CCC 971** — "*All generations will call me blessed*": "The Church's devotion to the Blessed Virgin is intrinsic to Christian worship." The Church rightly honors "the Blessed Virgin with special devotion. From the most ancient times the Blessed Virgin has been honored with the title of 'Mother of God,' to whose protection the faithful fly in all their dangers and needs.... This very special devotion ... differs essentially from the adoration which is given to the incarnate Word and equally to the Father and the Holy Spirit, and greatly fosters this adoration."⁵¹⁶ The liturgical feasts dedicated to the Mother of God and Marian prayer, such as the rosary, an "epitome of the whole Gospel," express this devotion to the Virgin Mary. (1172; 2678)

- Prayers are to be offered to Mary as our _____
 - **CCC 1014** — The Church encourages us to prepare ourselves for the hour of our death. In the ancient litany of the saints, for instance, she has us pray: “From a sudden and unforeseen death, deliver us, O Lord”; to ask the Mother of God to intercede for us “at the hour of our death” in the *Hail Mary*; and to entrust ourselves to St. Joseph, the patron of a happy death. (2676–2677)
 - **CCC 2673** — In prayer the Holy Spirit unites us to the person of the only Son, in his glorified humanity, through which and in which our filial prayer unites us in the Church with the Mother of Jesus. (689)
 - **CCC 2674** — Mary gave her consent in faith at the Annunciation and maintained it without hesitation at the foot of the Cross. Ever since, her motherhood has extended to the brothers and sisters of her Son “who still journey on earth surrounded by dangers and difficulties.” Jesus, the only mediator, is the way of our prayer; Mary, his mother and ours, is wholly transparent to him: she “shows the way” (*hodigitria*), and is herself “the Sign” of the way, according to the traditional iconography of East and West. (494)
 - **CCC 2675** — Beginning with Mary’s unique cooperation with the working of the Holy Spirit, the Churches developed their prayer to the holy Mother of God, centering it on the person of Christ manifested in his mysteries. In countless hymns and antiphons expressing this prayer, two movements usually alternate with one another: the first “magnifies” the Lord for the “great things” he did for his lowly servant and through her for all human beings; the second entrusts the supplications and praises of the children of God to the Mother of Jesus, because she now knows the humanity which, in her, the Son of God espoused. (970; 512; 2619)
- The Rosary is a string of beads associated with prayers that can and should be used in honor of _____ and in memory of _____
 - **ROSARY:** A prayer in honor of the Blessed Virgin Mary, which repeats the privileged Marian prayer *Ave Maria*, or *Hail Mary*, in “decades” of ten prayers, each preceded by the *Pater Noster* (“Our Father”) and concluded by the *Gloria Patri* (Glory Be to the Father), accompanied by meditation on the mysteries of Christ’s life.
 - **CCC 2676-2677 (summarized)** — This twofold movement of prayer to Mary has found a privileged expression in the *Ave Maria: Hail Mary [or Rejoice, Mary]: Full of grace, the Lord is with thee: Blessed art thou among women and blessed is the fruit of thy womb, Jesus. Holy Mary, Mother of God: Pray for us sinners, now and at the hour of our death:*
 - **CCC 2679** — Mary is the perfect *Orans* (prayer), a figure of the Church. When we pray to her, we are adhering with her to the plan of the Father, who sends his Son to save all men. Like the beloved disciple we welcome Jesus’ mother into our homes, for she has become the mother of all the living. We can pray with and to her. The prayer of the Church is sustained by the prayer of Mary and united with it in hope.⁴⁰ (967; 972)
 - **CCC 2682** — Because of Mary’s singular cooperation with the action of the Holy Spirit, the Church loves to pray in communion with the Virgin Mary, to magnify with her the great things the Lord has done for her, and to entrust supplications and praises to her.

Their Defense —

- A. Luke 1:28 — ²⁸ And he came to her and said, “**Greetings, O favored one**, the Lord is with you!”
- Catholics claim this favor extends to her whole life as a defense of the Immaculate Conception and sinless life
 - **Response:** Mary was “favored” based on God choosing her to give birth to the Messiah —not declaring her _____
- B. Luke 1:34 — ³⁴ And Mary said to the angel, “How will this be, **since I am a virgin?**”
- Catholics claim this is a vow of perpetual virginity
 - **Response:**
 - **A. Matthew 1:25** — but knew her not until she had given birth to a son. And he called his name Jesus.
 - “Until” implies _____ occurred after Jesus was born
 - **B. Matthew 13:55-56** — Is not this the carpenter’s son? Is not his mother called Mary? And are not his brothers James and Joseph and Simon and Judas? ⁵⁶ And are not all his sisters with us? Where then did this man get all these things?”
 - Clear reference to physical / literal family not a spiritual use of the word
 - Could’ve used term for cousins if these were Jesus’ cousins—but did not
- C. John 19:25-27 - ²⁵ but standing by the cross of Jesus were his mother and his mother’s sister, Mary the wife of Clopas, and Mary Magdalene. ²⁶ When Jesus saw his mother and the disciple whom he loved standing nearby, he said to his mother, “**Woman, behold, your son!**” ²⁷ **Then he said to the disciple, “Behold, your mother!”** And from that hour the disciple took her to his own home.
- Catholics claim this means Jesus didn’t have other siblings as a defense for perpetual virginity
 - **Response:** Jesus was entrusting Mary to John, a _____ at the crucifixion, rather than his brothers, who were not believers and not present at the crucifixion
- D. Luke 1:42-43 — ⁴² and she exclaimed with a loud cry, “**Blessed are you among women**, and blessed is the fruit of your womb! ⁴³ And why is this granted to me that the **mother of my Lord** should come to me?”
- Catholics claim this defends her veneration as the mother of God
 - **Response:**
 - **A. Jesus** _____ efforts to elevate Mary
 - **Luke 11:27-28** — ²⁷ As he said these things, a woman in the crowd raised her voice and said to him, “Blessed is the womb that bore you, and the breasts at which you nursed!” ²⁸ But he said, “Blessed rather are those who hear the word of God and keep it!”
 - Jesus calls her “woman” instead of “mother” (**John 2:1-4, 19:26**)
 - **B. Mary is the mother of God only in the** _____ **defined sense of** conceiving and giving birth to Jesus
 - The child born in her womb was divine, but she did not give rise to that divinity
 - There is nothing here that exalts Mary at all
 - Read through the New Testament - how much attention is given to Mary (almost none)

E. James 5:16 — ¹⁶Therefore, confess your sins to one another and **pray for one another**, that you may be healed. The prayer of a righteous person has great power as it is working.

- Catholics claim this means we must pray to Mary
- **Response:** There is Scriptural basis for asking a living person to pray for us—but _____ to ask a dead person to pray for us—and much harm to pray to a dead person
 - Bible is against praying to or speaking with the dead (**Leviticus 20:27, Deuteronomy 18:10-13, 1 Samuel 28:7-19**)

Christian Position —

- Mary is the mother of Jesus, a _____ servant who _____ submitted to God's will in giving birth to the Messiah
 - **Luke 1:46-49** — ⁴⁶And Mary said, "My soul magnifies the Lord, ⁴⁷and my spirit rejoices in God my Savior, ⁴⁸for he has looked on the humble estate of his servant. For behold, from now on all generations will call me blessed; ⁴⁹for he who is mighty has done great things for me, and holy is his name.
 - Mary recognized her own need _____
 - **Matthew 12:46-50** — ⁴⁶While he was still speaking to the people, behold, his mother and his brothers stood outside, asking to speak to him. ⁴⁸But he replied to the man who told him, "Who is my mother, and who are my brothers?" ⁴⁹And stretching out his hand toward his disciples, he said, "Here are my mother and my brothers! ⁵⁰For whoever does the will of my Father in heaven is my brother and sister and mother."
 - Mary was given no elevated _____ by Jesus
 - **Matthew 1:24-25** — ²⁴When Joseph woke from sleep, he did as the angel of the Lord commanded him: he took his wife, ²⁵but knew her not until she had given birth to a son. And he called his name Jesus.
 - Mary was a virgin _____ she gave birth to Jesus
 - **Matthew 13:54-56** — ⁵⁴and coming to his hometown he taught them in their synagogue, so that they were astonished, and said, "Where did this man get this wisdom and these mighty works? ⁵⁵Is not this the carpenter's son? Is not his mother called Mary? And are not his brothers James and Joseph and Simon and Judas? ⁵⁶And are not all his sisters with us? Where then did this man get all these things?"
 - Mary gave birth to _____—sons and daughters
- Jesus Christ is our _____—NOT Mary
 - **1 John 2:1-2** — My little children, I am writing these things to you so that you may not sin. But if anyone does sin, we have an advocate with the Father, Jesus Christ the righteous. ²He is the propitiation for our sins, and not for ours only but also for the sins of the whole world.
 - **1 Timothy 2:5** — ⁵For there is one God, and there is one mediator between God and men, the man Christ Jesus,
 - **Acts 4:12** — ¹²And there is salvation in no one else, for there is no other name under heaven given among men by which we must be saved."
 - **Hebrews 9:14-15** — ¹⁴how much more will the blood of Christ, who through the eternal Spirit offered himself without blemish to God, purify our conscience from dead works to

serve the living God. ¹⁵ Therefore he is the mediator of a new covenant, so that those who are called may receive the promised eternal inheritance, since a death has occurred that redeems them from the transgressions committed under the first covenant.

- Worship and pray to _____—NOT Mary or anyone else
 - **Jeremiah 7:18** — ¹⁸ The children gather wood, the fathers kindle fire, and the women knead dough, to make cakes for the queen of heaven. And they pour out drink offerings to other gods, to provoke me to anger.
 - **Matthew 6:6** — ⁶ But when you pray, go into your room and shut the door and pray to your Father who is in secret. And your Father who sees in secret will reward you.
 - **Colossians 2:18** — ¹⁸ Let no one disqualify you, insisting on asceticism and worship of angels, going on in detail about visions, puffed up without reason by his sensuous mind,
 - **Matthew 2:11** — ¹¹ And going into the house, they saw the child with Mary his mother, and they fell down and worshiped him. Then, opening their treasures, they offered him gifts, gold and frankincense and myrrh.
 - **Matthew 4:10** — ¹⁰ Then Jesus said to him, “Be gone, Satan! For it is written, “ ‘You shall worship the Lord your God and him only shall you serve.’ ”
 - **Exodus 20:3-5** — ³ “You shall have no other gods before me. ⁴ “You shall not make for yourself a carved image, or any likeness of anything that is in heaven above, or that is in the earth beneath, or that is in the water under the earth. ⁵ You shall not bow down to them or serve them, for I the Lord your God am a jealous God, visiting the iniquity of the fathers on the children to the third and the fourth generation of those who hate me,
 - **Revelation 19:10** — ¹⁰ Then I fell down at his feet to worship him, but he said to me, “You must not do that! I am a fellow servant with you and your brothers who hold to the testimony of Jesus. Worship God.” For the testimony of Jesus is the spirit of prophecy.

Addendum on Holy Water:

Catholic Position — Sacramentals

- Holy water is water blessed by a priest or bishop that reminds of baptism and _____
_____ to receive sanctifying grace
 - **HOLY WATER:** Blessed water, a sacramental whose sprinkling or use is a reminder of Baptism and a means of sanctification (1668).
 - **CCC 1667** — “Holy Mother Church has, moreover, instituted sacramentals. These are sacred signs which bear a resemblance to the sacraments. They signify effects, particularly of a spiritual nature, which are obtained through the intercession of the Church. By them men are disposed to receive the chief effect of the sacraments, and various occasions in life are rendered holy.”
 - **CCC 1670** — Sacramentals do not confer the grace of the Holy Spirit in the way that the sacraments do, but by the Church’s prayer, they prepare us to receive grace and dispose us to cooperate with it. “For well-disposed members of the faithful, the liturgy of the sacraments and sacramentals sanctifies almost every event of their lives with the divine grace which flows from the Paschal mystery of the Passion, Death, and Resurrection of Christ. From this source all sacraments and sacramentals draw their power. There is scarcely any proper use of material things which cannot be thus directed toward the sanctification of men and the praise of God.”

Their Defense —

- Numbers 5:17 — ¹⁷ And the priest shall take **holy water** in an earthenware vessel and take some of the dust that is on the floor of the tabernacle and put it into the water.
 - **Response:** The Old Testament priestly duties are made void through Christ—_____

 - There is no reference of holy water in the New Testament
 - There is no example of it in the church in the New Testament

Christian Position —

- Water baptism is one of the two _____ of the church,—which symbolizes an individual being placed into Christ (there is no “holy water”)
 - **Acts 16:30-34** — Then he brought them out and said, “Sirs, what must I do to be saved?” ³¹ And they said, “Believe in the Lord Jesus, and you will be saved, you and your household.” ³² And they spoke the word of the Lord to him and to all who were in his house. ³³ And he took them the same hour of the night and washed their wounds; and he was baptized at once, he and all his family. ³⁴ Then he brought them up into his house and set food before them. And he rejoiced along with his entire household that he had believed in God.